

Simulated Peer Review Questions for Real Science Review

Convert to MS Word or other word processor to use as a work sheet for the simulated peer review assignment.

Introduction: Questions to Answer

1. If there was a hypothesis, either stated or implied, what was it?
2. How well did the authors justify doing this study?
3. What are some other related ideas that they did not test?

Methods: Questions to Answer

1. What acts as a control group by receiving no treatment? What is the purpose for having this group and how well does it serve that purpose?
2. What factors (variables) that might affect the results are not taken into account?
3. What are the advantages and disadvantages of the procedures and equipment used?

Results: Questions to Answer

1. Do the results support the hypothesis or not? How convincing is that support?
2. Do you notice anything of possible importance in the data that authors failed to mention?
3. Is the variation in data large enough to suggest that some unknown variables interfere with reliable results? What might these be?
4. How big is the 'treatment' effect? Is it large enough to be of much practical importance?

Discussion: Questions to Answer

1. Summarize how the authors discussed the results in terms of their original hypothesis.
2. Did the authors point out ideas that go beyond the hypothesis?
3. What ideas for future research did the authors generate?
4. What ideas for future research do you generate?
5. How would you state the "so what" or take-home lesson?